

**STATE HISTORICAL RESOURCES COMMISSION
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION**

P.O. BOX 942896
SACRAMENTO, CA 94296-0001
(916) 653-6624 Fax: (916) 653-9824
calshpo@ohp.parks.ca.gov

www.ohp.parks.ca.gov

Julianne Polanco

.....*Chairperson*

Bryan K. Brandes

.....*Vice Chairperson*

ALBERTO BERTOLI, AIA

TRISH FERNANDEZ, M.A.

DONN GRENDA, Ph.D.

FERNANDO GUERRA, Ph.D.

DAVID PHOENIX

RICK MOSS

RICHARD SHEK, Ph.D

MILFORD WAYNE DONALDSON, FAIA

.....*Executive Secretary*



Quarterly Meeting
of the
STATE HISTORICAL RESOURCES COMMISSION
City Council Chambers
Palm Springs City Hall
3200 East Tahquitz Canyon Way
Palm Springs, California
April 16, 2009
9:00 a.m.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT

Julianne Polanco, Chair, Architectural History
Trish Fernandez, M.A., Historic Archaeology
Donn Grenda, Ph.D., Prehistoric Archaeology
Rick Moss, History
Richard Shek, Ph.D., Ethnic History

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT

Bryan K. Brandes, Vice Chair, Public Member
Alberto Bertoli, AIA, Architecture
Fernando Guerra, Ph.D., Folklife
David Phoenix, Public Member

STAFF PRESENT

Milford Wayne Donaldson, FAIA, State Historic Preservation Officer, Executive Secretary
Stephen Mikesell, Deputy State Historic Preservation Officer
Jay Correia, State Historian III, Registration Unit Supervisor
Cynthia Toffelmier, State Historian II
William Burg, State Historian I
Twila Willis-Hunter, Executive Secretary
Tara Lynch, Acting Chief Counsel

I. CALL TO ORDER

Legal notice having been duly given and a quorum being present, the State Historical Resources Commission (Commission) meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chairperson Julianne Polanco.

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairperson Julianne Polanco led the Pledge of Allegiance.

III. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF

The Commissioners introduced themselves; SHPO Donaldson introduced himself and the Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) staff.

IV. WELCOME

Honorable Lee Weigel, Councilmember, City of Palm Springs welcomed the Commission to Palm Springs; and Cindy L. Heizman, Executive Director, California Preservation Foundation, also welcomed the Commission.

V. RESOLUTION

Matt Mason accepted the Community Redevelopment Agency, Los Angeles (CRA/LA) resolution.

Lillian Burkenheim, Bibiana Yung and Sharon Lowe accepted the Asian Pacific Islander Communities and Community Redevelopment Agency Los Angeles (CRA/LA) resolution.

Robert Howard, State Parks, accepted the Inland Empire District, California State Parks, resolution.

VI. APPROVAL OF JANUARY 27, 2009 MINUTES

Chairperson Polanco asked for approval of the January 27, 2009 draft meeting minutes. Commissioner Donn Grenda moved to approve the minutes as submitted. Commissioner Trish Fernandez seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

VII. COMMISSION AND STAFF REPORTS

Chairperson Polanco stated how impressed she is to see resolutions given to two diverse multi-cultural community organizations.

Chairperson Polanco attended Lobby Day in Washington, D.C.

State Historic Preservation Officer Milford Wayne Donaldson, FAIA gave his report.

SHPO Donaldson attended the National Conference of State Historic Preservation Officers for Advocacy Day in Washington, D.C. on March 3, 2009.

SHPO Donaldson mentioned that Chairperson Julianne Polanco, former Commissioner Luis Hoyos, and Anthony Veercamp and Brian Turner with the National Trust, traveled to Washington, D.C. and visited twenty-six legislators, including Senators Boxer and Feinstein and Speaker Nancy Pelosi.

SHPO Donaldson also stated that after the visit to Washington, D.C. the California OHP received an additional funding for our budget. SHPO Donaldson stated that the money will be used to improve the office's obsolete computer systems, including the business operations and database management system.

SHPO Donaldson thanked Ronald Krueper, District Superintendent of Inland Empire, for the ride on the Palm Springs Aerial Tram and tour of Mt. San Jacinto State Park. He also thanked Beth Harris for the tour of the Kaufman House, one of Architect Richard Neutra's most famous designs.

SHPO Donaldson mentioned that in the month of February the Office of Historic Preservation was called upon by the California State Parks/Disaster Response team to look at sites and buildings, and to participate in a four day disaster response training exercise with State Parks employees.

SHPO Donaldson attended the California Main Street Alliance in Sacramento and the National Main Street Conference in Chicago, Illinois.

SHPO Donaldson mentioned the Mayor of San Francisco asked him to look at and evaluate how San Francisco's Civic Center, which is National Historic Landmark district, might go "green,"

SHPO Donaldson reported that the Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) is fully staffed. He further stated that the Federal Stimulus Plan is expected to increase the Office's workload by thirty to fifty percent because of the alternate energy sources and housing components of the funding package.

SHPO Donaldson mentioned the impact of solar and wind energy and Geothermal.

SHPO Donaldson mentioned OHP has been working with the National Park Service to develop a nationwide Geo Metadata Standard.

SHPO Donaldson invited the public to come to the California Preservation Conference.

SHPO Donaldson reported that in June he will be meeting with the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) to talk about GIS disaster response.

SHPO Donaldson mentioned that state employees are required to take furloughs, and that the furloughs will have the effect of reducing pay by 10%.

SHPO Donaldson mentioned the next California Preservation Foundation Conference will be held in Grass Valley in July 2010.

SHPO Donaldson thanked Cynthia Toffelmier for her outstanding work in putting together a professional Annual Report for the SHRC.

Deputy SHPO Stephen Mikesell reported that audio recordings of the SHRC hearings will be posted on the OHP website.

Deputy SHPO Stephen Mikesell reported on the Preserve America program.

VIII. POWERPOINT PRESENTATION OF NOMINATED PROPERTIES

Registration Unit staff presented a PowerPoint program that highlighted the properties to be heard by the Commission.

IX. CONSENT ACTION ITEMS

A. National Register of Historic Places, New Nominations

1. 27th Street Historic District
Los Angeles, Los Angeles County
Local Level of Significance
2. 52nd Place Historic District
Los Angeles Los Angeles County
Local Level of Significance
3. Killingsworth, Brady and Smith
Long Beach, Los Angeles County
Local Level of Significance
4. Sweasey Theater/Loew's State Theater
Eureka, Humboldt County
Local Level of Significance
5. Wakamatsu Tea & Silk Farm Colony
Gold Hill (vicinity), El Dorado County
National Level of Significance

B. California Register of Historical Resources, New Nomination

- 1 Paulding History House/South County Historical Society

Arroyo Grande, San Luis Obispo County
Local Level of Significance

Chairperson Polanco entertained a motion to approve the Consent Calendar. Commissioner Moss recommend the Commission approve for listing to the National Register of Historic Places: 27th Street Historic District, 52nd Place Historic District, Killingsworth, Brady and Smith, Sweasey Theater/Loew's State Theater, Wakamatsu Tea & Silk Farm Colony. Commissioner Grenda seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

Chairperson Polanco entertained a motion to approve the California Register of Historical Resources items. Commissioner Moss recommends the Commission approve for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources: Paulding History House/San Luis Obispo County. Commissioner Grenda seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

Kathleen Stanton from Humboldt County thanked the Commission for approving the Sweasey Theater/Loew's State Theater nomination.

Cynthia Thompson, Authentic Resources Team, thanked the Commission for approving the Paulding History House/South County Historical Society and Staff Cynthia Toffelmier for her work on the nomination. Ms. Thompson invited the Commission to the Village of Arroyo Grande.

Gary Hoving, representing the board of directors of the South County Historical Society, thanked the Commission for the support of the Paulding History House in their community.

X. NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES NOMINATIONS DISCUSSION AND ACTION

Chairperson Julianne Polanco asked the Commission if any wanted to recuse themselves from voting on the discussion and action items.

Commissioner Trish Fernandez announced she would recuse herself from voting on the Pegfair Estates Historic District because she works for the firm that prepared the nomination.

Chairperson Polanco stated Pegfair Estates Historic District will not be heard at this time because the Commission does not have a quorum without Commissioner Fernandez. The nomination will be heard at the next hearing meeting in Sacramento.

**A. First Baptist Church of Ventura
Ventura, Ventura County**

Cynthia Toffelmier presented the Staff Report. Staff recommended the State Historical Resources Commission determine the First Baptist Church of Ventura meets National Register Criterion C at the local level of significance and

recommended the State Historic Preservation Officer approve the nomination for forwarding to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register.

Judy Triem, San Buenaventura Research Associates, spoke in support of listing the nomination at the national level of significance.

Mitch Stone, San Buenaventura Research Associates, presented a Powerpoint presentation in support of the nomination and listing at the national level of significance.

Stephen Schafer, president of the San Buenaventura Conservancy, spoke in support of the First Baptist Church of Ventura nomination.

Reverend Bonnie Rose, Ventura Center for Spiritual Living, spoke in support of the nomination.

Cynthia Thompson, resident of Ventura, founder and past president of Ventura Conservancy and a historic preservation consultant, spoke in support of the nomination.

Chairperson Polanco stated there being no other public opposition speakers to the nomination, closed the public discussion and opened the Commission's discussion.

Commissioner Fernandez asked about other examples of Mayan Revival architecture in the United States and how does this example compare.

Mr. Stone referred to Pan-American Union Building in Washington DC designed in 1908 which introduced Mayan design elements. Mr. Stone indicated most examples throughout the United States from 1920s are movie theaters and mentioned Frank Lloyd Wright's warehouse in Wisconsin as an example.

Commissioner Fernandez stated it seems this particular subset of exoticism floundered and was short-lived at a national level, and requested clarification on how the applicant justified the First Baptist Church of Ventura as the high point of the subset of the Mayan Revival style.

Mr. Stone stated the property exemplifies the theme of architectural exoticism expressed in the Mayan Revival style more than any other he had uncovered in his research. Mr. Stone stated exotic architecture represents a moment in time when the public's desire for the new and different was at its peak. A church in the Mayan Revival style was unusual, and Mr. Stone credited the popularity of exoticism during this specific moment in American cultural history coupled with architect Stacy-Judd's persuasive powers as the forces behind the First Baptist Church of Ventura's Mayan Revival style architecture, sacrificial altar, and design elements. Mr. Stone restated that he had not found any other building that exemplified the Mayan Revival subset of architectural exoticism better than this building.

Commissioner Fernandez asked Mr. Stone if he considered eligibility under Criterion A.

Mr. Stone stated there was some discussion about this, but decided to pursue Criterion C.

Chairperson Polanco entertained a motion.

Commissioner Grenda moved that the Commission finds that First Baptist Church of Ventura meets National Register Criterion C at the local level of significance and recommends the State Historic Preservation Officer approves the nomination for forwarding to the National Park Service for the listing in the National Register. Chairperson Polanco seconded the motion.

Chairperson Polanco asked for Commission discussion.

Commissioner Fernandez asked about the repercussions if the property is listed at the local level and not at the national level.

Chairperson Polanco stated there are no repercussions; the property will receive same amount of protection.

Commissioner Fernandez asked if the level of significance will impact future preservation management issues.

SHPO Donaldson stated the property will be eligible for any incentives or grant programs available for National Register listed properties. The nomination identifies the property's character defining features which will be considered in cultural resources management processes.

Commissioner Shek suggested amending the current motion.

Chairperson Polanco stated the Commission must vote on the current motion.

Commissioner Fernandez stated she is not convinced that a local level of significance is appropriate.

Commissioner Moss stated he feels the First Baptist Church of Ventura should be considered at the national level of significance.

Acting Chief Counsel Tara Lynch stated the maker of the motion can withdraw the motion or request a vote on the motion.

Commissioner Fernandez asked for the Chairperson's opinion on the nomination's level of significance.

Chairperson Polanco stated she is not convinced listing the property at a national level of significance is appropriate. Chairperson Polanco stated the nomination was very well presented, and it was unusual to see the style applied to a church; however she felt the nomination and presentation did not provide enough information to convince her to support listing at a national level.

Commissioner Shek clarified that he supports recommending the national level and will vote against the present motion.

Chairperson Polanco asked Commissioner Grenda if he wanted to withdraw his motion or vote.

Commissioner Grenda stated he would like the vote taken.

Chairperson Polanco read the motion on the table to the Commissioners: the Commission finds that First Baptist Church of Ventura meets National Register Criterion C at the local level of significance and recommends the State Historic Preservation Officer approves the nomination for forwarding to the National Park Service for the listing in the National Register.

Deputy SHPO asked for roll call vote.

Commissioner Moss – no
Commissioner Shek - no
Commissioner Grenda – yes
Commissioner Fernandez – no
Commissioner Polanco – yes

Action: Motion failed three to two.

Chairperson Polanco called for another motion. Commissioner Fernandez moved that the Commission find that the First Baptist Church of Ventura meets National Register Criterion C at the national level of significance and recommends the State Historic Preservation Officer approve the nomination for forwarding to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register. Commissioner Shek seconded the motion.

Chairperson Polanco did a roll call vote.

Commissioner Moss – yes
Commissioner Shek – yes
Commissioner Fernandez – yes
Commissioner Grenda – yes
Commissioner Polanco – yes

Action: Motion carried unanimously.

XI. PUBLIC COMMENTS

John William Templeton, president/executive editor of eAccess Corp, made a presentation about the need to preserve properties associated with African-Americans in the City of San Francisco.

XII. CLOSED SESSION OF THE COMMISSION

AIMCO VENEZIA, LLC v. State of California, State Historic Resources Commission, et al., Los Angeles Superior Court Case Number BS 103 594.

No closed session

XIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS

Commissioner Fernandez reported for the Archaeological Resources Committee.

Commissioner Grenda reported for the Information Center Procedural Advisory Committee.

Commissioner Moss stated no report for the Cultural Diversity Committee.

Commissioner Shek told the Commission the background of the Wakamatsu property, indicating that there is a grave site near the nominated property, and that the applicant plans to amend the nomination boundaries to include the additional property.

Chairperson Polanco reported the Modern and Cultural Resources Committee is open for public participation.

XIV. COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS

Commissioner Fernandez asked if the Commission can meet in San Francisco.

Chairperson Polanco asked if staff could look in to it.

SHPO Donaldson said yes.

Chairperson Polanco reported that the remaining SHRC meeting dates and locations for 2009 will be July 31 in Sacramento or perhaps in San Francisco, and October 30 in Sacramento, the last meeting of the year.

XV. ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Polanco adjourned the regular meeting of the Commission at 12:05 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Milford Wayne Donaldson FAIA
State Historic Preservation Officer

Date

