

**STATE HISTORICAL RESOURCES COMMISSION
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION**

P. O. BOX 942896
SACRAMENTO, CA 94296-0001
(916) 653-6624
(916) 653-9824 FAX



ANTHEA M. HARTIG, Ph.D.
.....*Chairperson*
LAUREN W. BRICKER, Ph.D.
.....*Vice Chairperson*
CLAIRE BOGAARD
PHILIP P. CHOY
KATHLEEN GREEN
WILLIAM R. HILDEBRANDT, Ph.D.
LUIS HOYOS
MARY L. MANIERY
CAROL L. NOVEY

KNOX MELLON, Ph.D.
.....*Executive Secretary*

Quarterly Meeting of the
STATE HISTORICAL RESOURCES COMMISSION

Riverside City Hall
City Council Chambers
3900 Main Street
Riverside, California

November 8, 2002

MINUTES

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT

Anthea M. Hartig, Ph.D., Chairperson
Lauren W. Bricker, Ph.D., Vice Chairperson
Claire Bogaard
Phillip P. Choy
Kathleen Green
William R. Hildebrandt, Ph.D.
Luis Hoyos, AIA
Mary L. Maniery
Carol L. Novey

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT

None

STAFF PRESENT

Dr. Knox Mellon, Executive Secretary
Stephen Mikesell, Deputy State Historic Preservation Officer
Dr. Denzil Verardo, Chief Deputy Director, Administration, Parks and Recreation
Department
Eugene Itogawa, Staff Historian
Tara Lynch, DPR Staff Counsel

Rachel Magaña, Recording Secretary
Cynthia Howse, Staff Architectural Historian
Maryln Lortie, Staff Historian
Susan Jackson, Business Services Officer
Paula Jow, Associate Parks and Recreation Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

Legal notice having been duly given, the State Historical Resources Commission meeting was called to order at 8:00 a.m. by Chairperson Hartig.

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairperson Hartig led the Pledge of Allegiance.

III. CLOSED SESSION OF THE COMMISSION

Chairperson Hartig announced that the Commission would adjourn for a closed session, [Government Code §11126(e)(1) & (e)(2)(A)] to discuss pending litigation regarding the Foothill Drive-In Theatre in Azusa, Los Angeles County. Commissioner Hildebrandt moved to have the Commission adjourned to the Council Board Chambers. Commissioner Green seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

IV. OPEN SESSION OF THE COMMISSION

Chairperson Hartig reconvened the Commission meeting at 9:04 AM.

V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSION MEMBERS AND STAFF

Commission members introduced themselves. Mr. Stephen Mikesell introduced the Office of Historic Preservation staff and Legal Counsel Tara Lynch.

VI. WELCOME

The Honorable Ronald O. Loveridge, Mayor of Riverside, welcomed the Commission and stated that the City of Riverside takes pride in both Knox Mellon and Anthea Hartig as residents of Riverside and also pride in the Mission Inn. Riverside's history dates back to the 19th century. Incorporated in 1883, Riverside is the citrus center of Southern California. California Citrus State Historic Park will probably be the only place to be able to find a citrus grove in Southern California in the future. The City is also proud of Victoria Avenue, a wonderful historic linear corridor. Mt. Rubioux, with its wonderful vista, was a gift to the City from Frank Miller, owner of the Mission Inn. The City's Cultural Heritage Board is the advocacy group for historic preservation. Mayor Loveridge commended Ms. Janet Hansen, staff to the Cultural Heritage Board, for her leadership in historic preservation in Riverside.

Janet Hansen, Historic Preservation Specialist, City of Riverside, welcomed the Commission. The city takes historic preservation very seriously and has just completed a survey of the downtown, the first comprehensive survey that has been done in 20 years. In addition to locally designated districts, the city has identified five districts that

are eligible for listing on the National Register. The City has produced a preservation plan as part of its overall strategy for next year.

VII. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF AUGUST 2, 2002

Commissioner Choy moved to adopt the August 2, 2002 meeting minutes as presented. Commissioner Novey seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

VIII. COMMISSION AND STAFF REPORTS

A. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

Chairperson Hartig thanked the City of Riverside, the Mission Inn, the California Citrus State Historic Park, and the Cultural Heritage Board for their warm hospitality. Chairperson Hartig welcomed the members of the County Historical Commission, Chairperson John Warden, and the County Historic Preservation Officer Cindy Thomack. Chairperson Hartig also recognized Marion Mitchell-Wilson and the University of California, Riverside students in attendance at the Commission meeting.

Chairperson Hartig stated that the passage of Proposition 40 by the voters on March 5, 2002 has created a pool of money for historic preservation projects. With the help of Commissioners Novey and Green, the Commission will advocate for the commitment of Proposition 40 funds to be disbursed to preservation projects.

Chairperson Hartig announced, with pleasure, the addition of Luis Hoyos and Claire Bogaard as the newest Commissioners. Their contributions and dedication will truly enrich the Commission.

B. EXECUTIVE SECRETARY'S REPORT

Dr. Mellon stated that the federal government has provided grants to three important projects in California from the Save America's Treasure program for 2002. The Fort Mason, Pier 1 rehabilitation project in San Francisco received \$341,000. The Gamble House exterior restoration project in Pasadena received \$350,000. The University of California, Riverside, Keystone Mast collection received \$500,000.

Dr. Mellon stated that the Federal Preservation Forum will meet on November 19-21 at the Mission Inn in Riverside. This is a very important conference that will bring together federal cultural resources managers from all over the United States.

C. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Dr. Denzil Verardo, Chief Deputy Director, Administrative Services, Department of Parks and Recreation, presented copies of the book "By the People, For The People" to each Commissioner. The book, an historical narrative on the contributions of the Civilian Conservation Corp to the development of California State Parks, was published by the Department with the major work done by the Office of Historic Preservation. The Department is proud of the book because of a growing interest nationally with the works of the Civilian Conservation Corps.

Dr. Verardo expressed pleasure that members of the Commission will participate in the California Cultural Heritage Resources Summit to be held at the Getty Center in Los Angeles. The Summit represents an unprecedented gathering of not just historic preservationists but also people involved in museums, archives, humanities and the arts to examine historic preservation issues in a broad sense.

Dr. Verardo presented videotapes on Castroville, a small agricultural community in Monterey County for receiving a Heritage Fund Grant for its restoration of a Japanese Schoolhouse. Television stations televised the presentation of a ceremonial check from the Office of Historic Preservation to the Monterey County Redevelopment Agency on behalf of the Japanese American community.

D. PRESENTATION OF CALIFORNIA HERITAGE FUND CHECKS

Chairperson Hartig and Dr. Mellon presented two checks funded through the California Heritage Fund Program. A check for \$75,000 was presented to the City of Riverside for Victoria Avenue Restoration Project. Accepting the check were Tom Evans, Terry Nielson, and Dan Hayes. A check for \$50,000 was presented to the City of San Jacinto for the restoration of the Estudillo Mansion. Accepting the check were Jim Conner, Jim Ayers, Steve Harding, Mary Lanier, Tim Hultz, Del Kroker, and Richard Kroker.

Speakers

Jim Conner, Mayor of San Jacinto, expressed gratitude to the Commission for the contribution and accepted the check on behalf of the City. The Estudillo family has a long association with San Jacinto.

Dan Hayes thanked the Commission on behalf of the Victoria Avenue Historic Restoration Program and the Victoria Avenue Forever Organization. Mr. Hayes stated that there are over a thousand members throughout the world contributing to the revitalization of Victoria Avenue.

IX. RESOLUTIONS

Chairperson Hartig announced the awarding of Commission Resolution No. 2002-08 to recognize the City of Riverside; Resolution No. 2001-15 to recognize the City of Ontario as a Certified Local Government; Resolution of Commendation No. 2002-07 to recognize former Commissioner John D. Henderson; and Resolution of Commendation No. 2002-06 to recognize former Commissioner Sue F. Schechter.

X. SLIDE PRESENTATION

Staff Historians Cynthia Howse and Maryln Lortie presented slides illustrating all the historic properties on the Commission agenda.

XI. CONSENT CALENDAR

Chairperson Hartig announced that the Neutra, Richard and Dion VDL Research House II and Johnie's Broiler were removed from Consent Calendar and will be placed on Discussion Calendar.

A. NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES

The following National Register of Historic Places nominations have been scheduled on the Consent Calendar:

**Middough Brothers
Boys Shop**
Long Beach, Los Angeles Co.
Local Level of Significance

First Christian Church of Rialto
Rialto, San Bernardino Co.
Local Level of Significance

Chateau Colline
Los Angeles, Los Angeles Co.
Local Level of Significance

Canfield-Wright House
Del Mar, San Diego Co.
Local Level of Significance

Superior Oil Co. Building
Los Angeles, Los Angeles Co.
Local Level of Significance

Camarillo Ranch House
Camarillo, Ventura Co.
Local Level of Significance

Villa Park School
Villa Park, Orange Co.
Local Level of Significance

B. CALIFORNIA REGISTER OF HISTORICAL RESOURCES

The following California Register of Historical Resources nomination has been scheduled on the Consent Calendar:

Western Pacific Railway Depot
Stockton, San Joaquin County

Vice Chair Bricker moved to approve the Consent Calendar with suggestions to strengthen some current nominations for future consideration for the California Register of Historical Resources. Commissioner Green seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

Vice Chair Bricker withdrew her motion for the opportunity to discuss several nominations on the Consent Calendar. Commissioner Green seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

Vice Chair Bricker stated, as a matter of policy, staff has requested preparers to submit site plans to accompany the nominations. Vice Chair Bricker encouraged the Camarillo Ranch House owners in the future to amend the nomination to include a full discussion of the barn in the context of Criterion C. Vice Chair Bricker stated that the Superior Oil Company Building is a very important resource and encouraged the applicant to address how the building fits into the evolution of corporate culture in Los Angeles in the post war period.

Commissioner Hoyos requested that the nominations include more description and be as complete as possible. As an example, the Chateau Colline is an amazing building sited on a compact lot with a beautiful courtyard. Commissioner Hoyos urged the applicant to include a more comprehensive description of the property.

Chairperson Hartig summarized the suggested changes to improve the nominations. The applicant for the Middough Brothers be encouraged to include a site plan. The applicant for the Superior Oil Co. Building be encouraged to expand discussions of significance and architecture as to how the building fits into the history of corporate culture in Los Angeles within the context of the post war building patterns. The Camarillo Ranch House applicant be encouraged to amend the nomination at some point in the future to include discussions of the barn in the context of Criterion C for architecture. The applicant for the Chateau Colline discuss in more depth the site plan in the use of the site to architecturally develop the building.

Vice Chair Bricker moved to approve the Consent Calendar as amended and for the National Register nominations be transmitted to the State Historic Preservation Officer for forwarding to the Keeper for placement on the National Register of Historic Place at the appropriate levels of significance and for listing on the California Register of Historical Resources. Commissioner Green seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

Chairperson Hartig acknowledged Dr. Merlin Hendrickson and Dorothy Galley from the City of Rialto who have been saving the Rialto Church for 17 years. Chairperson Hartig also acknowledged and thanked the Mayor Bob Bell of Villa Park for the City's stewardship and Board of Director John Hills and Ranch Manager Gary Blum from the Camarillo Ranch Foundation.

C. NOMINATION PULLED FROM CONSENT CALENDAR

Neutra, Richard and Dion VDL Research House II Los Angeles, Los Angeles County

Chairperson Hartig announced the recusal of Vice Chair Bricker.

Commissioner Hoyos stated that the nomination prepared by Vice Chair Bricker is complete and very interesting. The nomination describes an unbroken line between VDL I and stated that the nomination was produced by students, which is remarkable and commendable.

Commissioner Green moved that the Neutra, Richard and Dion VDL Research House II nomination be transmitted to the State Historic Preservation Officer for forwarding to the Keeper for placement on the National Register of Historic Places at the State Level of Significance and also for listing on the California Register of Historical Resources. Commissioner Bogaard seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

Vice Chair Bricker returned to the room and stated that CalPoly Pomona received a grant from the Getty Foundation for the preparation of an historic structures report for the Neutra House. Vice Chair Bricker acknowledged the attendance of the Cal Poly students at the Commission meeting.

XII. DISCUSSION CALENDAR

A. NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES

Santa Fe Land Improvement Company Residence, La Flecha House Rancho Santa Fe, San Diego Co.

Chairperson Hartig announced that the Santa Fe Land Improvement Company Residence nomination has been pulled from the agenda at the request of the applicant.

B. CALIFORNIA REGISTER OF HISTORICAL RESOURCES

Loomis Historic Complex Arroyo Grande, San Luis Obispo Co.

Chairperson Hartig announced that the Loomis Historic Complex nomination has been pulled from the agenda at the request of the applicant.

True-Hartshorn House La Verne, Los Angeles Co.

Cynthia Howse stated that staff does not support the True-Hartshorn House nomination. The significance of the property in La Verne's architectural evolution has not been established. OHP staff inspected the house, as well as other buildings of the same era, and concluded that other buildings had more significance.

Vice Chair Bricker reported that the nomination claims the True-Hartshorn House to be a grove house. The structure is not a grove house because the grove no longer exists. A grove house is an example of a resource in which architecture and landscape must both, be present. The house is an 1897 residence but when compared with other contemporary houses, there has been a loss of integrity. It does not meet the standards to be listed on the California Register.

Commissioner Hoyos concurred with Vice Chair Bricker's assessments.

Vice Chair Bricker moved to concur with staff's findings to determine that the True-Hartshorn House is not eligible for listing on the California Register of Historical Resources. Commissioner Hoyos seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

Johnie's Broiler Downey, Los Angeles County

Cynthia Howse stated that Johnie's Broiler maintains very high integrity and is eligible for the California Register. However, the owner objects to the listing.

Speakers

The following speakers spoke in support of the nomination:

Peter Moruzzi, Historic Resources Consultant for Friends of Johnie's Broiler;

Ken Bernstein, Director of Preservation Issues, Los Angeles Conservancy;

Alan Leib, Chairman, Los Angeles Conservancy Modern Committee;

Chris Nichols, Former Chair, Los Angeles Conservancy Modern Committee;

John English, Board Member, Los Angeles Conservancy Modern Committee; and

Analisa Hungerford, Friends of Johnie's Broiler.

The following speaker spoke in opposition to the nomination:

Christos Smyrniotis, owner of Johnie's Broiler, opposed the nomination because of economic restrictions imposed by historical designation.

Vice Chair Bricker stated that Johnie's Broiler is an outstanding resource with a strong association with car culture as well as having architectural significance. Vice Chair Bricker praised the applicant for developing a context utilizing architectural literature and encouraged the applicant to pursue a National Register listing.

Commissioner Hildebrandt acknowledged that the Commission must evaluate the historical significance of the properties irrespective of the economic considerations.

Commissioner Bogaard moved to determine Johnie's Broiler eligible for the California Register of Historical Resources due to owner objection and to adopt the findings. Commissioner Novey seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

C. FINDINGS

Azusa Foothill Drive-In Theater

Azusa, Los Angeles County

Commissioner Hoyos recused himself.

Tara Lynch reported that on February 1, 2002, the Commission considered the application and received testimony in evidence to hear the Azusa Foothill Drive-In Theater on whether or not it is eligible for the California Register. At that hearing the Commission heard testimony from the proponents and opponents of the application, including the City of Azusa. After hearing the evidence and testimony, the Commission voted to determine the property eligible for listing on the California Register over the owner's objection. Findings were adopted that reflected that decision. The Office of Historic Preservation proposes amending the findings so that the findings can explicitly address the objections raised by the City of Azusa based on the record and the evidence received by the Commission. The Office of Historic Preservation has prepared amended proposed findings for the consideration of the Commission.

Chairperson Hartig stated that the findings are being amended to explicitly answer the objections of the City of Azusa.

Speakers

Patrick Perry, representing Azusa Pacific University, spoke in opposition to adoption of the amended findings.

Jennifer Buckman, City Attorney for City of Azusa, spoke in opposition to adoption of the amended findings.

Ken Bernstein, Director of Preservation Issues, Los Angeles Conservancy, spoke in support of the amended findings.

Chairperson Hartig requested that the name on page two of the draft findings, Rick Coles, City Manager, City of Azusa, be changed to read Rick Cole.

Commissioner Green moved to adopt the amended findings for the Azusa Foothill Drive-in as presented to the Commission for the determination of eligibility for the California Register of Historical Resources. Vice Chair Bricker seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried as follows: 6 ayes, 1 abstention, and 1 recusal.

XIII. ACTION AND DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. Election of Officers for 2003

Commissioners Hildebrandt and Novey of the Nomination Committee moved to nominate Anthea Hartig as Commission Chair and Lauren Bricker as Commission Vice Chair for 2003. Commissioner Green seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

B. State Historical Resources Commission 2002 Annual Report

Eugene Itogawa stated that the Commission is required to prepare an annual report in January of each year.

Chairperson Hartig stated that the legislative and the action goals for 2002 focused on securing Proposition 40 funds for the California Heritage Fund and funding for California Historic Resources Information Systems (CHRIS). Chairperson Hartig reported that Commissioners Hildebrandt and Maniery have been working hard with the Information Centers. Chairperson Hartig proposed a new committee for 2003 to explore improvements for the California Register nomination process by establishing a Bulletin 15-like document for the evaluation of resources to the California Register and to empower the Committee to recommend changes to the State Codes and Regulations to tighten the nomination procedures.

Commissioner Maniery moved to adopt the draft State Historical Resources Commission 2002 Annual Report. Commissioner Hoyos seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

XIV. CALIFORNIA REGISTER OF HISTORICAL RESOURCES

A. REQUEST FOR REDETERMINATION

Coronado Belt Line Right of Way
San Diego County

Hans Kreutzberg stated that on February 1, 2002, the Commission voted to list a 7.5-mile long remnant of the former 25.5-mile Coronado Railroad Right of Way in the California Register of Historical Resources under Criterion 1 for its association with events that make a basic contribution to the broad patterns of San Diego history. Under Criterion 3, the Commission found that this remnant embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period and method of late 19th to mid 20th century railroad construction and represents a significant engineering achievement. Pursuant to Section 4855(B)(2) of Title 14, Chapter 11.5 of the California Code of Regulations, the Cities of San Diego, Chula Vista, Imperial Beach and the San Diego Port Authority have requested the Commission to reconsider that previous determination to list the remnant of the Coronado Belt Line Right of Way in the California Register. The petitioners have asserted that there is significant error in the facts, information and analysis contained in the Coronado Belt Line Right of Way California Register nomination that was submitted to the Commission. The petitioners provided new information that they assert demonstrates precisely where, how and to what degree information facts and analysis in the nomination are in error. They therefore assert that the Commission's decision to list the remnant of the Coronado Belt Line Right of Way in the California Register was based on substantial error. In formulating this recommendation regarding the petitioner's Request for a Redetermination, staff to the Commission has reviewed past and current information submitted to the Commission regarding this resource. This review of all the documentation was supplemented by staff review of the resource in the field on October 25, 2002. In reviewing all documentation and in formulating its recommendation regarding this Request for Redetermination, staff focused exclusively on data directly pertinent to the significance of the resource and to its integrity. Information not related directly to the significance of the resource, its integrity, or related directly to the criteria pertaining to the request regarding the redetermination played no role in staff's review and recommendation. In staff's opinion, new information contained in the report by the petitioners, demonstrates that reasonable grounds exist under the applicable section of the California Code of Regulations for the Commission to reconsider its Findings of May 2, 2002 and its decision of February 1, 2002 to list the remnant of the Coronado Belt Line Right of Way in the California Register. Staff recommends that this Request for Redetermination be granted.

Speakers

The following speakers spoke in support of the Request for Redetermination:

Stephen Wee, JRP Historical Consulting Services;

Dave Hanson, Deputy City Attorney, City of Chula Vista;

Chris Salomone, Community Development Director, City of Chula Vista;

Frank Gaines, Project Manager, City of San Diego Engineering and Capitol Projects;

Paul Jacob, Project Engineer, City of San Diego;

Stephen Vance, Senior Transportation Planner, San Diego Association of Governments;

Dennis Landaal, Engineer, City of San Diego;

Maria Burke Lia, Attorney, Port of San Diego; and

James Barwick, Assistant Director, Port of San Diego.

The following speakers spoke in opposition to the Request for Redetermination:

David Swarens, Save Our Heritage Organization;

Bruce Coons, Executive Director, Save Our Heritage Organization;

John L'Estrange, Attorney, City of National City;

Alana Coons, Board Member, Save Our Heritage Organization;

Alexander Bevil, Historian, Save Our Heritage Organization;

Richard Hamilton, Owner, San Diego Rail;

Ed Kravitz, Co-Founder, San Diego Railway Partners;

Stephen Van Warmer, Historian, Save Our Heritage Organization;

R. Mitchel Beauchays, City Councilman, City of National City;

Arnold Hunsberger, Past President, San Diego Railroad Museum, Save Our Heritage Organization; and

Mike Ramon, San Diego Railroad Museum.

Chairperson Hartig stated that the Commission received a letter from DPR Legal Counsel Tara Lynch in response to Susan Brandt-Hawley regarding the time issue that was raised by Mr. Kravitz. After the February 1st meeting, there were no Findings prepared consistent with the Commission's determination. Because the Commission did not support staff's recommendation, revised Findings were reviewed and adopted at the May 2nd meeting. The timeline started when the final transmission notice went out in early June.

Commissioner Hildebrandt stated that there was an open question about whether construction of the rail line was a major engineering achievement across the marshland area or just a standard line in general. Mr. Wee's report constitutes

significant additional new information that demonstrates that the Commission's original determination was based on errors of fact. The Commission needs more discussion on what the actual period of significance is for the railroad line and whether or not the materials that exist there now are relevant to that period of significance, which would also be a new Finding if there are no materials left that actually relate to the core period of significance. Based on the two issues, the past decision was based on significant error and, therefore, a redetermination is appropriate.

Commissioner Novey asked in reference to the specific examples of other railway segments on the National Register, what is the difference between those listed and the Coronado Belt Line.

Hans Kreuzberg stated that the SHPO did not review comments on the nomination of the Mt. Lowe Railroad, which is on the National Register. Office staff today would not have recommended that the Mt. Lowe nomination be approved.

Commissioner Hildebrandt asked what the process was by which it got listed.

MarylN Lortie stated that the nomination was for a federally owned property. A nomination for a property that is federally owned can be sent directly to the Keeper if the SHPO had not commented. This was a period in which the office was short several staff members and the applicant had the right to send the nomination directly to the Keeper in 1992.

Hans Kreuzberg reported that the property is owned by the Angeles National Forest.

MarylN Lortie reported that the Torrey Pines Historic District includes Torrey Pines Lodge of 1923, the Guy Fleming House of 1927, and a roadway. The roadway contributed to the development of Torrey Pines and still retains adequate integrity. Half of the road retained much of its original concrete and includes culverts from the historic era of 1915. In addition, other important defining features include early automobile roads, its narrowness, its lack of shoulders, the hairpin turns and steep grades still present and readily identifiable and distinguishable from a modern road that would be constructed today. In considering the rarity of this type of resource, its integrity was judged to be adequate. In staff's opinion, if the resource were nominated as a segment of the road from Los Angeles to San Diego, staff does not feel a two-mile segment of that 100-mile road would be considered adequate to represent its significance.

Commissioner Green asked staff if other linear nominations with dikes or ditches have come through the office.

Hans Kreuzberg reported that the Office of Historic Preservation does have a lot of experience with linear features of various types.

Commissioner Hoyos asked staff would the integrity of a linear line be devalued or compromised by the repeated repair and upgrade with contemporary materials.

Hans Kreutzberg reported that in some quarters integrity of a linear resource relates to consistency of purpose or use. It is the flow of history idea; the evolution of technology that is represented in the changes that are made to this resource over time. So long as it continues its original function, its transportation of something, it has integrity. Using its particular type of technology from one point to another point is all that is needed. It does not matter whether this operation started in 1900 and continues today. If it looks like it continues to carry out the purpose or function for which it has built, then most of the infrastructure of the property could have been put in place and reflect a period that post World War II or 60's or 70's without affecting integrity. The function and use over time is really what prevails in determining what the significance of the property might be. The flow of history model does not consider the actual age or representation of the infrastructure as well as the aspects of the integrity, location, and alignment relative to a specific period of significance, a well justified beginning, and a well justified end which should be 50 years or older.

Commissioner Novey asked staff if the railroad was still in operation.

Hans Kreutzberg reported that the operation of a part of the railroad is for heritage tourist use.

Commissioner Choy stated that there was evidence that there was such a railroad. In regards to preservation, every little piece of evidence is to be made in certifying significance.

Commissioner Hildebrandt moved to grant a redetermination hearing. Vice Chair Bricker seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried, five ayes, three nays and one abstention.

B. REDETERMINATION

Coronado Belt Line Right of Way
San Diego County

Hans Kreutzberg stated that staff's recommendation is that the facts and evidence do not support the assertion that this property represents what staff believes are indicators of economic importance. Staff recommends that there is not enough evidence to the assertion that the property had both World War I and II related significance. Staff recommends that the evidence regarding the engineering related construction activity does not demonstrate it as a significant engineering endeavor. Mr. Kreutzberg stated that the Belt Line is not significant in the area of architecture and engineering. With regard to the engineering significance crossing of marsh lands in the south bay area in the initial period of construction the evidence indicates that the technology and materials that were available at the time are used here, were of a standard, non-distinguished type. It was not difficult to cross flat marshlands. The remainder of the staff report regarding the integrity of the nominated property, staff suggests considering all of the information that has been produced in this matter, that the integrity of the alignment and location is significantly and severely impaired. The design materials and workmanship, the integrity of setting, the integrity of feeling and association are likewise impaired. The staff report has many examples of integrity loss. Staff's recommendation for the Coronado Belt Line Right

of Way is that the evidence does not make a convincing case that this 7.5 mile long remnant is eligible for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources under either criteria discussed. Substantial evidence indicates that in all aspects integrity, of the original Belt Line Right of Way, has been significantly compromised. Staff suggests that regarding archeological potential, that this property does not have the potential to yield significant scientific data or historical information beyond that contained in all of the documentation that the Commission and staff have seen pertinent to this application.

Speakers

The following speakers spoke in opposition to the redetermination:

Bruce Coons, Executive Director, Save Our Heritage Organization, stated that the line into National City and into the marshlands, despite the testimony that has been heard, has virtually been unchanged. It exhibits all the aspects of early railroading. The property was made to be an industrial railroad and continues to be an industrial railroad. The salt works has been unchanged since the railroad was built. There are tourist train rides on the railroad and Eco tourism rides through the wildlife sanctuary. Many of the industries that have been supportive, the remnants can still be seen along the way. The gun powder plant and the embankments can still be seen. The carriage manufactories that were built in 1888 are still there along the Right of Way and the National City Depot located at the north end is a National Register at the state level. The association of resources along the line is still a tremendous asset. The power of the railway to convey 19th century and early 20th century railroading is still very present. The previous Commission had spectacular things to say about the line and was all very positive. The Coronado Belt Line was designed to be an urban railroad from the beginning.

Hans Kreuzberg referred to the integrity discussion in staff reports and said that this discussion does everything to disprove Mr. Coons' point.

Mitch Beauchays, City Councilman, City of National City, stated that the National City Depot is about a half a block away. The line is currently in use for tourism but also in use to deliver sand to the refuge. The line was in use several years ago for soda ash cars. It is an active freight line operated by the San Diego and Imperial Railroad, subcontracted through Metropolitan Transit Development Board to the Railroad Museum. The owner is not opposed to the listing and the chairman of the Metropolitan Transit Development Board was outraged when he heard about the arrogant way the Port of San Diego and the City of Chula Vista went about trying to abandon the line and lease arrangements. There are six trestles on the 7-mile line. The line connects with the salt works. The line was critical for the military during World War II. The line is surrounded by wildlife refuge. Residents of National City and Chula Vista, along with the City Councilman who represents the area from the salt works to Imperial Beach boundary, all requested historical designation for the railway.

Commissioner Hildebrandt asked staff to comment on the linkage between the railroad and the salt works and other facilities.

Hans Kreuzberg stated that the salt works was determined eligible for the inclusion in the National Register pursuant to Section 106 consultations. It was considered eligible for its significance as an industrial landscape, for being an unusual example of that type of infrastructure with that particular purpose. The nomination had a very discreet period of significance that was part of the determination. It was significant under Criterion C for its industrial engineering design, its rarity and under Criterion A for its historic significance. At no time was it ever considered that its very existence was due to have been entirely operation of the Coronado Belt Line Right of Way. That was never exclusively the only means of transporting the salt out of the area nor did the entire existence of salt works operation depend on the significance attributed to the Belt Line.

Commissioner Maniery asked how many miles go across the marshlands.

Hans Kreuzberg stated there are 1.3 miles.

Commissioner Green asked if any of the 6 trestles were significant for engineering and if any are located in the marshlands.

An unidentified public speaker stated that there are two marshland areas in National City and in the salt works all around the bay. The trestles all end in the marshlands and would not be in the industrial area.

An unidentified public speaker stated that nowhere in the guidelines for nominating a historic resource for either National Register or California Register does it say that a property has to be an outstanding engineering or technological achievement. There was no mention in an earlier report to the contributions that the Chinese Americans made to the railroad. There were 150 Chinese among the construction crews.

Commissioner Choy stated that there is no mention of Chinese labor in the report.

Arnold Hunsberger, Past President San Diego Railroad Museum, stated that significance has been addressed and circulated an historic photo of the Belt Line.

Ed Kravitz, Co-founder, San Diego Railway Partners, stated that one of the major arguments is the lack of significance to Chula Vista and Imperial Beach, that the only significance was to Coronado. Mr. Kravitz disagreed. The levees were common place but levees in tide lands were new engineering techniques. No one knew the effects or the fluctuation of tides. Mr. Kravitz reported that John Speckles consolidated all the railroads in San Diego. The original Coronado branch route went through what is now Fort Emory, which was a Calvary post at one time garrisoned by Buffalo Soldiers to protect the Coronado from invasion.

Stephen Van Warmer, Historian, Save Our Heritage Organization, stated that the Coronado Belt Line was rebuilt in spite of not showing a profit. It was needed for military use, to develop San Diego Bay and the breakwaters, and to carry passengers and tourists to the City of Coronado through the 1930s.

Commissioner Hildebrandt requested that speakers refrain from mentioning segments of the line outside of the nominated boundaries. The significance of the line based on its association with other places like Coronado is questionable because of an integrity problem.

An unidentified public speaker stated that the nominated segment contains rails and ties that still appeared to be a 19th century railroad. This segment was selected because it is clearly an important resource in its present state and that it had the most power to convey the history of the period to the public a 19th century railroad.

David Swarens stated that the designation should not impede any plans for economic development like bike trails or anything else. Designation is a good faith process.

Don Johnson, President San Diego Electric Railway Association, Inc., stated that he has spent 40 years as a pastor and is very concerned about the comments from those opposing the designation. The Commission is in a very difficult position.

NOTE: The deliberation on the Coronado Belt Line Redetermination was interrupted by a fire alarm. Commission members, OHP staff, and audience evacuated the building during a half-hour recess from 3:35 PM to 4:05 PM. Don Johnson resumed his testimony after the meeting reconvened.

Mr. Johnson implored to keep the Coronado Belt Line in tact to educate both current and future generations regarding the vital role that railroads played in the building of San Diego and to experience the history, to enhance the economic prosperity in the South Bay, and to encourage tourism.

Alana Coons, Board Member, Save Our Heritage Organization, stated Chula Vista's own Historic Resources Board supported designation; San Diego Historic Resources Board supported designation. The San Diego City Council has not heard this issue and the district's councilman supports designation. The owners do not oppose designation. This has been a 15 year battle and SOHO has presented simple solutions to the developers and the board. The integrity of the site is in tact. There are archeological resources still being discovered. It is a remarkable resource with a bay front tourist railroad.

The following speakers spoke in support of redetermination:

Steven Wee, JRP Historical Consulting Services, stated that the California Register program requires that resources retain integrity and the railroad right of way fails to meet that criterion. This railroad is a boom era railroad, an early shoreline railroad in San Diego. The resources that were directly related to that line are no longer there or have been compromised. There are no significant engineering achievements; the current trestles are trestles from a later period, which are standard type trestles. The railroad was not the only means of transportation to move goods. These lines are no longer economically viable. It is no longer an independent shoreline railroad; it is owned and operated by Southern Pacific Railroad.

An unidentified public speaker claimed to personally review a report that was issued at the previous meeting. The report supports Hans Kreutzberg's findings on two occasions that this property does not merit listing on the California Register.

Vice Chair Bricker stated that on October 25th, Mr. Kreutzberg and she visited the resource and met with opponents for the designation. In viewing the resources, Vice Chair Bricker reported that there was a serious problem with the integrity. The resource is almost lost and is almost entirely submerged. If there were a viable period of significance, it would have to begin 1917 because of the flood that seems to have washed away so much of what was there. Vice Chair Bricker stated that she is in support of staff's findings.

Commissioner Choy stated that he disagrees with Vice Chair Bricker. History is not made up of only physical evidence. Physical evidence is not needed to prove what was there before. Much of our past has been buried. The evidence illustrating the presence of the Chinese in building California is very meager. The fact that the Chinese were involved with the Belt Line gives evidence that they were there, which is a very important part of the development. It reinforces Criterion 1.

Commissioner Bogaard moved to support staff's recommendation to support redetermination of the Coronado Belt Line Right of Way. Commissioner Manieri seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried: Five ayes, three neys and one abstention.

- C. The following nominations have been placed on the National Register of Historic Places. The National Park Service Notice of Listings identifying these nominations has been received by the Office of Historic Preservation since the last regular meeting of the Commission. *These properties also have been placed on the California Register of Historical Resources.*

Ziegler Estate , Los Angeles, Los Angeles County	6/27/02
Forest Home Farms , San Ramon, Contra Costa County	6/28/02
Mohnike Adobe , San Diego, San Diego County	7/17/02
Congdon, Joel R., House , San Juan Capistrano, Orange County	4/17/02

XV. MEETING DATES AND LOCATIONS FOR 2003

Selection of Meeting Dates and Locations for 2003

February 7, 2003	Sacramento	Quarterly Meeting
April 24, 2003	Santa Barbara	Quarterly Meeting
August 1, 2003	Vallejo	Quarterly Meeting
November 7, 2003	Pasadena	Quarterly Meeting

Commissioner Manieri moved to approve the meeting locations and dates with the contingency that if there is a budget crisis, the Commission will respond appropriately. Vice Chair Bricker seconded the motion. **Action:** Motion carried unanimously.

XVI. PUBLIC COMMENTS AND HEARINGS

Presentations of comments or concerns by the general public are encouraged:

A. National Park Service and the Route 66 Program ~ Michael Taylor, NPS

Michael Taylor, Program Manager for the Route 66 Corridor Preservation Initiative, National Park Service, Santa Fe, New Mexico, stated that Route 66 is a 2,400-mile linear resource. The program is directed by Congress through an act that was passed in 1999 to assist various communities, local governments and private land owners to best preserve and protect the historic resources that make up Route 66. This would include road alignments, historic thematic structures such as gas stations, motels and diners. Mr. Taylor expressed a desire to partner with the Commission in the future with initiatives in California regarding Route 66.

Chairperson Hartig thanked Mr. Taylor for his presentation and for coming to the Aztec Hotel rededication in Monrovia on November 5, 2002.

B. Bureau of Land Management (BLM) ~ Rolla Queen

Rolla Queen, Historic Archeologist, California Desert District, BLM, Riverside, stated that BLM manages 11 million acres in Southern California and is the largest land owner and land manager statewide. BLM is a multiple use agency subject to intensive pressures and challenges for historic preservation more so than any other federal agency. BLM manages the most spectacular resources in California. Several years ago BLM commissioned a study of the Desert Training Center, which is locally known as Patton's Camps. The Desert Training Center is an 18,000 square mile area in California and Arizona developed by General George Patton as a training ground for troops in World War II. Over a million men trained at the center from 1942 to 1944. It became the template for modern training in the California desert for other places like Clear Lake and Twenty-Nine Palms. The landscape associated with the training center is the most spectacular landscape that exists. It is huge and the challenge of managing it is almost incomprehensible. BLM has prepared property nominations for the resource at Iron Mountain Camp and Camp Ives. Mr. Queen reported that BLM has also been working with a volunteer group to develop a sky trail concept and to develop a veteran's history project to capitalize on some of the remaining veterans that still have knowledge of the area. In addition, BLM has been an early supporter of managing resources along Route 66 on BLM lands. BLM is currently funding a context study of Route 66. BLM is hoping to have a final product by the end of the year that will be a foundation for a multi property nomination. BLM this year has provided a direct grant to the California Route 66 Heritage Preservation Foundation of \$40,000 to assist in the stewardship of Route 66. Mr. Queen reported that there will be a Federal Preservation Forum meeting on December 19-21, in Riverside. Mr. Queen stated that it is very important for BLM to partner with OHP to accomplish specific goals such as the implementation of an electronic database (GIS) as a site management tool.

XVII. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 4:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. Knox Mellon
Executive Secretary

DATED _____